

15A DCSE2005/1272/F - DEMOLITION OF, AND ALTERATIONS TO, TIMBER FRAMED, STEEL CLAD BARN, TO CREATE 5 CAR PORTS WITH STORES AT WALFORD COURT, WALFORD, ROSS-ON-WYE, HEREFORDSHIRE, HR9 5QP

15B DCSE2005/1277/L - DEMOLITION OF, AND ALTERATIONS TO, TIMBER FRAMED, STEEL CLAD BARN, TO CREATE 5 CAR PORTS WITH STORES AT WALFORD COURT, WALFORD, ROSS-ON-WYE, HEREFORDSHIRE, HR9 5QP

**For: Mitchell & Son Homes Ltd per Geoff Jones
Architect, 53 Broad Street, Ross on Wye,
Herefordshire HR9 7DY**

Date Received: 21st April, 2005 Ward: Kerne Bridge Grid Ref: 58689, 20557

Expiry Date: 16th June, 2005

Local Member: Councillor Mrs. R.F. Lincoln

1. Site Description and Proposal

1.1 Planning permission and listed building consent was granted in 2003 for conversion of barns at Walford Court, Walford, into 6 dwellings. Walford Court is a listed building and the barns are considered to be curtilage buildings. The scheme, which is currently being implemented, did not include covered parking although domestic sheds were specified. An application (SE2004/4120/F) to erect 5 car ports and external store and to convert an open-fronted agricultural building (which was not included in the original proposal) was subsequently submitted. Permission was refused in January 2005 for the following reasons:

"1. The proposal would not comply with the Council's Policies and Supplementary Planning Guidance with regard to conversion of rural buildings as the following requirements have not been met:

- (i) the building shall be capable of conversion without the need for extension
- (ii) the scheme shall respect the existing character of the building, and
- (iii) open cart sheds and other suitable buildings shall be used for garaging and storage
- (iv) that the building be marketed to secure business re-use

The Policies referred to are CTC.13 and CTC.14 of Hereford and Worcester County Structure Plan and C.36 and C.37 of South Herefordshire District Local Plan plus Supplementary Planning Guidance: Re-use and Adaptation of Traditional Rural Buildings.

2. The proposed development by reason of the extent, design and massing of new buildings and walls would harm the setting of these attractive stone barns which are within the curtilage of the listed Walford Court. The proposal would conflict therefore with Policy C.27A and C.29 of South Herefordshire District Local Plan.”
- 1.2 The current application seeks alternative covered parking. The existing triple bay Dutch barn which was to be demolished as part of the barn conversion scheme would be partly retained (the north-western bay). It would be reduced in height by about 3m. and clad with profiled steel sheeting on roof, rear and sides. The front (south-east) elevation would be open but the rear 2m. depth of each car port would be boarded to form domestic stores. The application site includes more land from the farm complex to the north-west which would remain in use for agricultural purposes.
- 1.3 Separate applications have been submitted for conversion of the open-fronted cart shed to a dwelling (SE2005/1328/F & SE2005/1264/L). These are not the subject of this report.

2. Policies

2.1 Planning Policy Guidance

PPS7	-	Sustainable Development in Rural Areas
PPG15	-	Planning and the Historic Environment

2.2 Hereford and Worcester County Structure Plan

Policy CTC1	-	Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty
Policy CTC13	-	Buildings of Special Architectural or Historic Interest
Policy CTC14	-	Criteria for the Conversion of Buildings in Rural Areas

2.3 South Herefordshire District Local Plan

Policy C1	-	Development Within Open Countryside
Policy C4	-	AONB Landscape Protection
Policy C5	-	Development within Areas of Outstanding Natural Beauty
Policy C36	-	Re-use and Adaptation of Rural Buildings
Policy C37	-	Conversion of Rural Buildings to Residential Use
Policy C44	-	Flooding
Policy SH24	-	Conversion of Rural Buildings
Policy GD1	-	General Development Criteria

2.4 Supplementary Planning Guidance

Re-use and adaptation of Traditional Rural Buildings

3. Planning History

3.1	SE2002/3372/F	Change of use and conversion of barns to dwellings.	-	Approved 30.9.03
	SE2002/3373/L	Conversion of barns to 6 dwellings. Demolition of steel/timber barns.	-	Approved 30.9.03

SE2004/4120/F	Conversion of barn to dwelling, erection of carports and external stores with 6 parking spaces.	-	Refused 21.1.05
SE2005/1264/L	Conversion of barn to a single dwelling.	-	Not determined
SE2005/1328/F	Conversion of barn to a single dwelling.	-	Not determined

4. Consultation Summary

Statutory Consultations

- 4.1 Environment Agency has no objection in principle but recommend that a condition be imposed regarding drainage.

Internal Council Advice

- 4.2 The Traffic Manager has no objection.
- 4.3 The Conservation Manager has no objection from an architectural point of view.

5. Representations

- 5.1 Walford Parish Council make the following observations:

“Members think that this Dutch barn is not worthy of retention in any form by reason of its bulk and unattractive materials in the setting of the surrounding listed buildings. It should be replaced with stone-faced, slate roofed storage facilities if these are really necessary.”

- 5.2 One letter of objection has been received from M Thomas, Walford Court, Walford, Ross on Wye HR9 5QP. In summary the following reasons are given:

- (1) The current proposals do not address the original reasons for refusal and the car ports are considerably worse than the prior proposal.
- (2) Corrugated steel clad residential buildings are completely unacceptable in rural Britain, especially next to listed buildings in an AONB. We are not in the Australian outback.
- (3) The Dutch barn is an eyesore. The principal benefit the community gained from the conversion of the barns was the restoration of the site that included the removal of this eyesore. A necessary evil for modern agricultural use, the barns should now be removed.
- (4) The original planning application for the site SE2002/3372 clearly stated that this Dutch barn was to be demolished. To now propose any building in the same location is tantamount to new build. The Dutch barn should no longer be considered an existing building for the purposes of planning.
- (5) The proposed carports are of such a different nature that they are not a conversion but rather new build. Only a small part of the original structure is re-used, it has new walls on three sides, several rooms. If this is acceptable then any modern farm buildings can be converted into residential buildings.

- (6) The carport/storage units will severely affect the character of this listed farm courtyard. They are completely unnecessary as there is sufficient space within the existing barns to accommodate both housing units and carports/garages. If the applicant now desires carports a revised application for the original buildings should be submitted. The current proposal is contrary to C27(i).
- (7) The development is outside the settlement boundary and presumption must be against any further building.
- (8) As an ex cart-port the cart barn could be used as a carport. This use would retain the character and functional use of this listed building perfectly, while also meeting the carport needs of the applicant.

The full text of these letters can be inspected at Southern Planning Services, Blueschool House, Blueschool Street, Hereford and prior to the Sub-Committee meeting.

6. Officers Appraisal

- 6.1 Walford Court barns form an attractive group of buildings arranged around a rectangular courtyard. In view of this layout and the style of building it is understandable that the conversion scheme proposed open car parking rather than, as the SPG recommends, using existing buildings for garaging. As noted above the open-fronted building was not included in the original scheme. It is not certain, irrespective of the outcome of the current applications whether that building would be available for car parking and even if it were to be the total number of covered parking spaces would be 9. Between 6 residential units this is not considered to be excessive. The proposed carports are wider (4.2m) than necessary for a single car but would not be sufficient space for two cars.
- 6.2 Paragraph 5.3 of Supplementary Planning Guidance encourages provision for carports within the existing buildings. The Dutch barn, although it would necessarily be modified, is an existing building. It is an agricultural building and does not therefore appear out of place in this farmyard setting. It would provide a more substantial and appropriate barrier between converted barns and modern agricultural buildings than the high stone wall currently approved. The wooden framework which forms the structure of the building is of interest and the simple shape and proportions are not displeasing. It is not considered that the building as it is now, or as proposed, is an eyesore. It is in any case quite well screened by the converted barns and large modern agricultural buildings from public viewpoints. A further benefit is that there would be less need for open car parking.
- 6.3 The changes to the building essentially involve shortening the timber uprights that form the main walls of the barn. The building is the structure; the cladding is ephemeral and optional: some barns have sides as well as roofs, other have not and the cladding has to be replaced as it wears out. No doubt for practical and safety reasons the wooden structure would have to be dismantled before alteration. It would not be used for residential accommodation. The building as modified would be suitable for domestic storage and this is considered to be within the spirit of the Council's guidelines for barn conversions.

RECOMMENDATION

In respect of DCSE2005/1272/F

That planning permission be granted subject to the following conditions:

1 A01 (Time limit for commencement (full permission))

Reason: Required to be imposed by Section 91 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990.

2 B01 (Samples of external materials)

Reason: To ensure that the materials harmonise with the surroundings.

3 G01 (Details of boundary treatments)

Reason: In the interests of visual amenity and to ensure dwellings have satisfactory privacy.

4 G04 (Landscaping scheme (general))

Reason: In order to protect the visual amenities of the area.

5 G05 (Implementation of landscaping scheme (general))

Reason: In order to protect the visual amenities of the area.

In respect of DCSE2005/1277/L

That planning permission be granted subject to the following conditions:

1 C01 (Time limit for commencement (Listed Building Consent))

Reason: Required to be imposed by Section 18(1) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.

2 B01 (Samples of external materials)

Reason: To ensure that the materials harmonise with the surroundings.

3 G01 (Details of boundary treatments)

Reason: In the interests of visual amenity and to ensure dwellings have satisfactory privacy.

4 G04 (Landscaping scheme (general))

Reason: In order to protect the visual amenities of the area.

5 G05 (Implementation of landscaping scheme (general))

Reason: In order to protect the visual amenities of the area.

Informative(s):

- 1 - **N15 - Reason(s) for the Grant of Planning Permission and Listed Building Consent**

Decision:

Notes:

.....

Background Papers

Internal departmental consultation replies.